

# Identification of Problems in Accessibility of Public Facilities for Disabled Persons

Meisayu Dwitami, Winda Greatta Zakiah, and Galuh Putranto, Dwi Aries Himawanto  
SebelasMaret University, Surakarta, Indonesia

## Abstract

*This study aims to identify accessibility problems in public facilities and public spaces for people with disabilities. This research is a systematic literature review through research articles and journals related to accessibility topics. The results of the literature review indicate that most of the infrastructure of the facilities and public areas that are available are not in accordance with the standards. Among these are ramp infrastructure that is too steep, relatively small access width, too high sidewalks, unavailability of special toilets and parking lots, and lack of visual or audio information. The right solution for accessibility problems is not only rearranging various infrastructures, but also needs to be supported by accessibility information to stakeholders and society so that synergic partnerships can be formed.*

**Keywords** - accessibility, disability, facilities and public public spaces

## I. INTRODUCTION

At present, the topic of accessibility is quite echoing along with the topic of inclusion. Both are closely related to disability groups. Accessibility can be interpreted as the ease of things to be achieved, can be in the form of services, objects, or environment. Groups of people with disabilities have accessibility rights, both physical and non-physical. Providing an easily accessible environment will realize a culture of inclusion, which is equal opportunity in all aspects of life and livelihood. Just like normal people, people with disabilities have the need to move outside the home and socialize. So facilities and public areas are a must. Public areas as a container must be able to provide a conducive environment to meet the conditions of interaction, namely providing opportunities for social contact and communication. Public areas can be interpreted as follows "has a multiplicity of meanings, strictly political political definition of citizen collective to popular usage of designating everyone and anyone. In each instance of use, the accent is inevitably placed on one particular meaning in that it is never necessarily connotated. The meaning of space may seem, on first contact, more clear cut: it refers to the physical dimensions of a particular location". The question is whether the facilities and public areas have accommodated the needs of persons with disabilities?.

Quoting from Minister of Public Works Regulation No. 30 / PRT / M / 2006 concerning Technical Guidelines for Facilities and Accessibility in Buildings and Environments around buildings, there are four principles of accessibility, namely: a) everyone without exception must be able to reach all public places and environments; b) everyone without exception must be able to enter all public places and environments; c) everyone without exception must be able to use all places and the general environment; d) all people without exception must be able to reach, enter, and use all facilities in a public place or environment without discrimination or harassment of social rights. According to IFLA (<http://archive.ifla.org>) disability services consist of: a) parking area, environment and all areas must be accessible for people who use wheelchairs, walkers / mobility; b) the entrance should be opened automatically; c) special disabled rooms; d) reading and listening rooms for diffable users. Several countries have clear regulations regarding accessibility for people with disabilities, including Indonesia, Malaysia, Iran and Kosovo. But in realizing the regulation there are still several problems. The purpose of this study was to analyze problems in the realization of the provision of accessibility for people with disabilities. Based on the background above, the research question is how are the problems of accessibility of public facilities and public areas for people with disabilities?

## II. METHODOLOGY

This study uses a systematic literature review through research articles and journals relating to accessibility, disability, public facilities, and public space. Literature reviews obtained through online databases include: *Portal Garuda*, *Proquest*, and *Google Scholar* using keywords: accessibility, disability, public facilities, and public space. The criteria for the articles used in this review are (1) the participants used are disability groups, (2) the research involves the accessibility of public facilities and public space as a discussion of the dependent variable, (3) published articles ranging from 2007-2015. The data analysis used is descriptive. The results obtained in the study are presented in narrative form.

### III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A review of the literature review that fits the criteria consists of eight articles. Each has a discussion related to research variables, namely accessibility of public facilities and public areas for disability groups. The purpose of the article which is relevant data for the purpose of this study is to identify problematic accessibility of public facilities and public areas for disability groups so that they can develop a culture of inclusion with supporting facilities and public areas.

**Table 1 Research Data Article**

Writers	Action	Participant	Results
Kurniawan	Analysis of typology and accessibility of Trans Jogja bus stops	11 Trans Jogja bus stop	are five main problems relating to ramp, entrance, inner space, bus stop, and surrounding environment.
Bayat, Bodaghi and A. N. Zainab (2013)	accessibility and facilities at public libraries and universities in Iran.	42 persons with disabilities and five architectural experts	sons with disabilities, the accessibility of public libraries is based on five components with a total of 3.13 points from a rating scale of 5, while the architect group values the number of points 2.69.
Hassan Khalifeh Soltani, Mashita Sham, Mohamad Awang, and Rosdam Yaman (2012)	the level of satisfaction and security of people with disabilities associated with accessibility and facilities of commuter terminals.	80 people with disabilities using KL Central and Klang Central Station access	in assessing station infrastructure, people with disabilities give very low satisfaction scores on ladder infrastructure, ramp, footpaths. As for the infrastructure of the waiting room and the escalator with disabilities gives a high value of satisfaction. The lowest level of security for persons with disabilities is when they walk to the station and when riding the chosen public transportation mode, namely the train.
Mujimin (2007)	ulation of public facilities in building accessibility and environment, and realization of	Minister of Public Works Regulation No. 30 of 2006	mental requirements for accessible public facilities include many clear regulations, even the details are accompanied by illustrations, but the manifestations are hampered due to lack of knowledge and understanding of the management of public facilities and groups of people with disabilities who are not aware of their rights so that partnerships have not been

**Table 2 Research Data Article**

			established .
Slamet Tohari (2014)	describes public perceptions of disability and accessibility of public facilities in Malang.	15 general public facilities with qualifications for places of worship, government agencies, private agencies, and educational institutions.	the total 72% of public facilities are not accessible, and 24% are less accessible. Besides that, in to the perception of the Malang community on disability groups it is still permissive, resulting in bad stigma and discriminatory actions.
Asiah Abdul Rahim, Nur Amirah Abd Samad (2010)	Conducted case studies on hotel accessibility for groups that experienced elderly (elderly groups) and disabilities in Malaysia.	Two five star hotels in East Malaysia.	the two hotels are quite accessible but there is a need to develop facilities such as warning symbols and Braille for disturbance of vision, widening toilet doors, flat door knobs, and siren lights to be installed in bathrooms and bedrooms for people with M.S
ie (2014) Assessed the	fulfillment of accessibility in Yogyakarta in 2012.	Persons with forced disability, blindness, speech, and	to access physical accessibility in Yogyakarta progressed but were not significant and not mutually integrated so that disability groups only enjoyed a portion.
Rozafa Basha (2015)	Conducted case studies on accessibility of public areas in the cities of Prishtina and Prizren, Kosovo.	Prishtina City and Prizren City	are several problems in both cities. The sidewalk is the most crucial physical barrier. However, there is already a map of the locations of obstacles for the city of Prizren as a basis for further development.

Research shows that there are some problems in the accessibility of public facilities and public areas for those with disabilities:

1. Accessibility to the Trans Jogja bus stop is not good, there are five problems found, namely; a) entry access in the form of a ramp has a angle of 10 degrees (3 degrees steeper than the slope standard) so that it is not possible for wheelchair users to access the road independently; b) the position of the entrance is at the end of the ramp, the relatively wide width, and the type of "turn slite" entrance makes it difficult for wheelchair users and crutches; c) the space inside the bus stop is only 155 cm, while the minimum standard for the mobility of persons with disabilities is 150 cm; d) the distance between the bus and the bus stop when riding and descending passengers ranges from 30-40 cm, thus endangering passengers; and e) bus stops have not been integrated with the environment, for example the space at the base of the ramp is directly facing the street lights.

2. Accessibility of public libraries and university libraries in Iran has two different views from disability groups and architect groups. This assessment is based on five components, namely parking lots, ramps, exclusive rooms, interior layout, and public sites. Diffable groups assess parking lots, ramps, and exclusive room components in inadequate categories, while the interior layout and components of public spaces are in sufficiently adequate categories. On the other hand, the architect group considered that the components of the ramp were adequate, the components of exclusive booths and public sites were adequate, and the interior and parking spaces were very inadequate. In addition, what needs to be considered is the attitude of librarians to diffables, awareness of policies and the rights of persons with disabilities to be improved.

3. Accessibility and facilities from KL Central and Klang Central Station Malaysia stations are assessed based on the level of satisfaction of disability groups when using infrastructure and a sense of security from entering the station to dropping out of transportation mode. Groups of persons with disabilities assess the infrastructure of ladders, ramps and trails that have not been satisfactory, and when going to and from the station, and when riding the train do not feel safe. But for other infrastructure in the form of parking lots, embossed warning symbols, waiting rooms, signposts, escalators, and adequate lifts. In addition, disability passengers feel safe when buying tickets, in vehicles, and disembarking from transportation modes.

4. Besides being limited to the budget, the provision of accessible public facilities in Indonesia has not been maximally realized due to the lack of knowledge and understanding of public facilities managers regarding accessibility regulations, plus a lack of understanding of persons with disabilities regarding their accessibility rights so that there is no cooperation from both parties. It is necessary to disseminate information about diffable accessibility to all components of government administrators, the

general public and government institutions so that cooperation can be formed intact and solid.

5. Referring to Minister of Public Works Regulation No. 30 of 2006, out of 125 public facilities in Malang, 72% of them were not accessible. things are assessed by the availability of ramps, guiding blocks, special toilets, and special parking lots. There are several places that have provided the above components but do not meet the standards. The interesting thing is that private institutions have a higher percentage of accessibility than government institutions, which means that the government is still negligent in regulation. The limited accessibility of public facilities in Malang has resulted in rarely people with disabilities being found in public spaces. Respondents from the general public who have met persons with disabilities are only around 3%, so the diffable group in Malang still gets a negative stigma and is considered abnormal.

6. Accessibility of two five-star hotels in East Malaysia is quite good, but because both are built before there are Malaysian standard regulations regarding facilities for people with disabilities, it is necessary to develop facilities, such as accessible parking with appropriate sizes, widening toilet doors, and warning symbols. and braille, and also uses contrasting colors on the glass interior for guests with visual disabilities and sirens in the bedroom and bathroom to help people with hearing loss as a notification of emergency situations for people with hearing loss. In addition, management is recommended to renovate at least two rooms for disabled guests.

7. The development of accessibility in Yogyakarta has not involved persons with disabilities in policy formulation to the fullest so that progress is not significant. After conducting interviews, persons with physical disabilities, blind, deaf, and mentally retarded were given a list of physical accessibility facilities that needed to be realized, including; a) 1:12 slope ramp, toilet for wheelchair users, and low public telephone for physical disturbances; b) audio systems, and guiding blocks on public roads for the visually impaired; c) visual information, siren lights, and running text for the deaf; d) buildings with blunt angles for intellectual disturbances. In addition, it is necessary to obtain non-physical access such as sign language translators and increased awareness of civil servants such as health workers and bank officers.

8. In Kosovo, there are laws and administrative instructions that prohibit discrimination, but the control mechanism for implementing laws is lacking. In addition, the level of discrimination is increasing, because people are still permissive to regard disability issues as only a medical responsibility. Especially for

Prishtina City and Prizren City, the main problem is the sidewalk. All sidewalks in the city are not accessible for people with electric wheelchairs; sidewalks on pedestrian crossings are steep; high roadside sidewalks; Lack of Increased Color Contrast on stairs, directions and other road surfaces; and the lack of protective fences around urban trees which endanger blind people

#### IV. CONCLUSION

Accessibility to public facilities and areas in various places still needs to be improved. The problem encountered is actually not the rules, but in applying them. Many infrastructures are built to accommodate the needs of persons with disabilities but not according to standards. Among these are the ramp infrastructure that is too steep, the access width is relatively small, the sidewalk is too high, there are no special toilets and parking spaces, and a lack of visual or audio information. Besides physical access, non-physical accessibility is still not visible, for example, public service officers have insights and awareness about persons with disabilities. So, the right solution is not only to rearrange various infrastructures, but also needs to be supported by socialization about accessibility to stakeholders and the general public so that a culture of inclusion in the future can be fully realized.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Asiah Abdul Rahim and Nur Amirah Abd. Samad. Accessible Built Environment for the Elderly and Disable in Malaysia: Hotels as Case Studies. *Journal of Construction in Developing Countries* 15 (2), 1-21 (2010).
- [2] Basha, Rozafa. Disability and Public Space-Case Studies of Prishtina and Prizren. *International Journal of Contemporary Architecture "The New ARCH"* 2 (3), (2015). DOI: 10.14621 / tna.20150406.
- [3] Bodaghi, Nahid Bayat and A. N Zainab. (2013). Accessibility and Facilities for the disabled in public and university libraries of buildings in Iran. *Information Development*. SAGE. DOI: 10.1177 / 0266666912461265.
- [4] Harry Kurniawan. Typology of Renovation of Accessibility of Trans Jogja Shelter. *Journal of Inclusion I* (1), 1-17 (January-June 2014).
- [5] M. Syafi'ie. Fulfillment of accessibility for people with disabilities. *Journal of Inclusion I* (2). July-December (2014).
- [6] Mujimin. (2007). Provision of Human Public Facilities for Disabled Accessibility. *Educational Dynamics* Number 1 Year XIV, 60-75 (May 2007).
- [7] Seed Hassan Khalifeh Soltani, Mashita Sham, Mohamad Awang, and Rostam Yaman. (2012). Accessibility for Disabled in Public Transportation Terminal. In the Proceedings of the Asia Pacific International Conference on Environment-Behavior Studies. Elsevier B. V Selection, 89-96 (2011).
- [8] Slamet Tohari. (2014). View of Disability and Accessibility of Public Facilities for Persons with Disabilities in Malang City. *Indonesian Journal I* (1), 27-37 (June 2014).